

**Parish:** HOLBROOK

**Location:** Part garden of, Cedar House, The Street, Holbrook, IPSWICH

**Proposal:** Submission of details under O.P.P. B/05/00422/OUT - the siting, design and the external appearance of the buildings, and the landscaping of the site for the erection of 2 No. dwellings and alterations to existing vehicular access. As amended by drawings received on 05/10/2009.

**Applicant:** Mill Construction (East Anglia) Ltd

**Case Officer:** Chris Tivey

**Date for Determination:** 30 November 2009

---

**This planning application is for the approval of Reserved Matters following the grant of Outline planning permission for the erection of 2no. dwellings.**

**The access for the site has already been approved by virtue of the grant of the Outline planning permission and therefore, this application focuses solely upon the siting, design and external appearance of the buildings, and the landscaping of the site.**

#### **THE SITE**

1. The application site is approximately 0.23 hectares and originally formed part of the garden to Cedar House situated within the Built-up Area Boundary of Holbrook and between the Ipswich Road to the east (B1080) and The Street (from which the site gains access) to the west.
2. The site can be considered to be previously developed and includes redundant tarmac tennis courts and paths, but does contain a number of mature trees.
3. The application site is surrounded by residential properties on all sides with a large detached dwelling 3 Coachman's Paddock to the north, the Beeches and Otter House (again both detached) to the east, the aforementioned Cedar House to the south. East Row, a terrace of Victorian cottages is situated to the west.

#### **THE PROPOSAL**

4. The application seeks Reserved Matters approval for the siting, design and external appearance of the 2no. dwellings that have been permitted on the site; and landscaping.
5. Both proposed dwellings are identically designed, albeit in a handed manner. The original details submitted with the planning application were for 2no. two and a half storey Georgian style villas that would have been more appropriate in a more urban situation.
6. Following the submission of amended drawings, in conjunction with Officer consultation, the proposal now before Members is for dwellings of a style and form that respects the local setting.

7. The proposed dwellings have an overall internal floor area of 252m<sup>2</sup> which compares to the internal area of the originally proposed dwellings of 336.5m<sup>2</sup> , resulting in a 25% reduction. Furthermore, the proposed dwellings would now be over two storeys, as opposed to three.
8. The overall width of each dwelling would be 17.1m with the main range being 6.2m deep and 8.55m high. Each dwelling would have a forward projecting gable of 6.1m deep (6m wide) set 0.75m down from the main ridge. Each dwelling would have four bedrooms.
9. Materials that are proposed to the dwellings would comprise clay pantiles to the roof slopes with red facing brickwork to the main ranges. The forward projecting gables would be finished in a smooth render and have a black painted brick plinth at ground level. Two dormers would be situated on the inside face of the roof slope of each respective gable projection, these would be finished with plain tiles. Joinery would be timber with white painted sash windows with brick arches over at ground floor level.
10. The Plot 1 dwelling situated within the northern half of the site (and facing in a southerly direction) would have a rear garden of 622m<sup>2</sup>. A detached double garage serving this property would be situated to its west between it and the boundary shared with 12a East Row.
11. The Plot 2 dwelling would be orientated in a manner that directly addresses the driveway to The Street and would face in a south westerly direction, so as to minimise overlooking of dwellings in East Row and to avoid harm to the mature trees on the site. The detached double garage to this property would be situated at the end of the shared driveway, adjacent to and mid way along the eastern boundary and situated between both plots.

## RELEVANT HISTORY

12. B/04/01498/OUT - Refused

Outline - Erection of 3 No. 2½ dwellings and works in connection with the conversion of existing coach house and outbuildings to 1 No. dwelling with vehicular access and parking.

13. B/05/00422/OUT - Granted

Outline - Erection of 2 No. dwellings and alterations to existing vehicular access as amended and amplified by tree survey received 20 March 2006 and block plan showing access arrangements received 16 May 2006.

## NATIONAL GUIDANCE

14. **PPS1** Planning and Sustainable development
15. **PPS3** Housing

## PLANNING POLICIES

16. The Development Plan comprises the East of England Plan, adopted 2008, saved policies in the Suffolk Structure Plan, adopted 2001, and the Babergh Local Plan (Alteration No. 2) adopted 2006. The following policies are relevant to this proposal:

### **East of England Plan - 2008**

- **SS1** Achieving Sustainable Development
- **ENV6** The Historic Environment
- **ENV7** Quality in the Built Environment

### **Babergh Local Plan (Alteration No. 2) 2006**

- **HS02** Villages
- **HS03** Non Sustainable and Sustainable Villages
- **CN01** Design Standards
- **CN06** Listed Buildings

**The relevant documents can be viewed via the internet. Please see Page 4 for details.**

### **CONSULTATIONS**

17. PC – Reluctant to accept as they still have concerns over the access.
18. LHA – No objection subject to the imposition of conditions.
19. Arboricultural Officer – Objected to the original proposal on the grounds that the proposed dwelling at Plot 2 was too close to Tree T005 and would result in insufficient space for its future growth and lead to dominance of the rear garden. He recommended that the footprint of the proposed building be moved a minimum of 2m from the root protection area (*this has been overcome by the new submission*). He advised that due to the sensitivity of some of the works required, details of the monitoring programme outlined at paragraph 4.5 of the submitted Arboricultural Report will be required, in order to help ensure successful implementation.

### **REPRESENTATIONS**

20. Twenty five letters of objection were received from the first round of consultation, many of these cite traffic generation and highway safety as reasons to refuse planning permission, notwithstanding the fact that the principle of the erection of two dwellings on the site and their access onto the public highway have already been approved.
21. Concerns were also raised with respect to design and scale of the original proposed Georgian style urban villas. Other matters raised that are still relevant to the determination of the application are as follows:
  - The properties are large and would not benefit the local community as they would not be affordable for local people.
  - Capacity of the existing drainage system questioned.
  - Impact upon trees, some of which have Tree Preservation Orders.
  - Impact of construction traffic upon other road users including Emergency Vehicles and pedestrians.
  - Loss of privacy from overlooking.
22. At the time of writing the report, eight letters of objection had been received on the amended proposal, four of which were from individuals who had previously written in on the original submission. Considerations material to the determination of this planning application include:

- No justification for four bed dwellings which is out of character for the village.
- The dwelling on Plot 2 is very close to the boundary with Otter House which would lead to a serious encroachment on its privacy.
- The height of the dwellings, although reduced, is still excessive.
- Loss of privacy to the East Row properties from Plot 2.

## **PLANNING CONSIDERATIONS**

23. As already indicated, the principle of erecting two dwellings on this site has been accepted through the grant of Outline planning permission B/05/00422/OUT. Furthermore, the matter of access has also been previously approved.
24. Therefore, the consideration of this application falls upon the detailed elements namely siting, design and external appearance of the dwellings, and the landscaping to the site (the Reserved Matters).
25. Policy HS02 of the Babergh Local Plan Alteration Number 2 (2006) states that new development will be acceptable in villages providing that there is no adverse impact on, *inter alia*, the scale and character of the village; residential amenity; and the natural and built environment.

### **Scale and Character**

26. As previously described, the original design for the two dwellings was considered inappropriate to the site's village setting, being far more urban in appearance than that considered to be appropriate.
27. However, taking into account the site's immediate and wider context within Holbrook, large detached houses exist elsewhere and are set within generous plots, particularly along the western side of the Ipswich Road (including Coachman's Paddock and Pettwood Gardens due north east); the majority of these large detached dwellings are well articulated with traditional spans and roof pitches.
28. Officers have concluded that the proposed dwellings are of an appropriate scale and character for the village and being two storey in nature they would not be over-dominant upon their surroundings and in particular upon the modestly scaled and adjoining East Row to the west.
29. The proposed materials are entirely appropriate to the rural area and therefore Officers are of the view that no objection should be raised with respect to design and external appearance of the dwellings.

### **Residential Amenity**

30. The layout of the site as now proposed is such that no demonstrable harm would be caused to the amenities of the occupiers of surrounding residential properties. The properties most likely be affected by this proposal are the East Row cottages which are laid out in a manner such that their private areas of amenity space are laid out to their front (north).

31. The Plot 1 dwelling situated within the northern half of the site has two windows at first floor level situated on the western elevation of its forward projecting gable, serving a bedroom and a bathroom. The distance to the western boundary shared with 12a East Row would be approximately 23.9m, which with an intervening Laurel hedge at an average height of 4m would ensure that there would be no material overlooking from these windows.
32. No windows are situated on the facing elevation of 12a East Row and therefore, taking into account this and the generous spacing within the site, it would be difficult to substantiate a reason for refusal on this basis.
33. Furthermore, at its closest the Plot 2 dwelling to the eastern boundary shared with Otter House would be 10.7m; with a minimum building-to-building distance of 33.6m and intervening vegetation on the boundary, including a mature Sycamore tree (Tree T005), the amenities of the occupiers of both these properties would be mutually protected.
34. By virtue of the scale of the proposed buildings and the distance to the site boundaries, the proposed dwellings would not be overbearing or give rise to a loss of light.

#### **The Natural and Built Environment**

35. The application was submitted with a full Arboricultural Report and in consultation with the Council's Tree Officer the proposal now overcomes original concerns with respect to the relationship between the Plot 2 dwelling and Tree T005.
36. All existing hedging to the site boundaries is shown to be retained, the site is not within a Conservation Area and the proposed dwellings are sufficiently distant from the listed dwelling "The Beeches" not to have a detrimental impact upon its setting.

#### **REASON FOR DECISION**

37. The proposed 2no. dwellings to be erected on the application site, pursuant to the grant of B/05/00422/OUT would result in buildings of an architectural design and form that is sympathetic to the site's surroundings and furthermore would not give rise to demonstrable harm to the amenities of occupiers of adjacent residential properties or adversely impact upon protected trees, or nearby Listed Buildings and their settings. The Reserved Matters details, as submitted, therefore comply with Policies SS1, ENV6 and ENV7 of the East of England Plan 2008 and Policies HS02, HS03, CN01 and CN06 of the Babergh District Local Plan Alteration No. 2 2006.

#### **RECOMMENDATION**

- (1) Approve the reserved matters application.

(NB. No additional conditions to those on the Outline planning permission are deemed necessary).