

Parish: LAVENHAM**Location: The Dandy Cottage, Brent Eleigh Road, Lavenham, Sudbury, CO10 9PE****Proposal: Erection of detached garage/cartlodge with first floor guest bedroom.****Applicant: Mr I. Gilder****Case Officer: Alex Scott****Date for Determination: 15/12/2009**

The application is reported to Development Committee following a request from the Local Member. A panel of Members visited the site on 23rd December 2009, to assess the proposal's impact on the host listed building, the general character and landscape qualities of the area.

THE SITE

1. The site is located on the A1141 Brent Eleigh Road, approximately 350 metres to the south of the historic village of Lavenham.
2. The site lies outside of Lavenham's Built Up Area Boundary (BUAB) and within a Special Landscape Area (SLA). A public footpath runs adjacent to the eastern boundary of the site, affording public views to the rear of the property. The land to the rear of the site rises sharply.
3. The Dandy Cottage is a Grade II listed building, important for its clay lump construction and humble, small scale character.
4. The site has had recent permissions for an increase in its residential curtilage from 0.09ha to 0.14ha in size; the erection of a single-storey side extension to the host building; and the erection of a single-storey detached garage/cartlodge. None of these permissions have, as yet, been carried out.

THE PROPOSAL

5. The application seeks planning permission for the erection of a two-storey detached outbuilding in the south-east corner of the site for use as a garage/cartlodge and workshop, at groundfloor level, with ancillary residential accommodation at second-storey level.
6. The proposal would be orientated such that its side elevation would face the Brent Eleigh Road. The proposal would have a maximum ridge height of 5.85 metres above ground level, a maximum width of 8.4 metres, and a maximum depth of 7.3 metres.
7. The proposal is an alternative to the single-storey detached garage/cartlodge granted permission in September of 2009. The approved garage/cartlodge has a maximum height of 4.7 metres. The proposal would exceed this height by 1.15 metres (being 5.85 metres in height).

RELEVANT HISTORY

8. 2009 - Planning permission granted for the erection of single-storey side extension; detached garage/cartlodge (existing side lean-to canopy and single detached garage to be demolished); and construction of private packaged treatment plant to replace existing septic tank - Ref. B/09/00915/FHA.
9. 2009 - Listed building consent granted for the erection of a single-storey side extension and alterations; and the demolition of an existing side lean-to canopy - Ref. B/09/00916/LBC.
10. 2009 - Planning permission granted for the change of use of adjacent agricultural land to domestic garden - Ref. B/08/01698/FUL.
11. 1988 - Listed building consent granted for internal and external alterations including insertion of a new window to side elevation; and the erection of a front porch - Ref. B/LB/88/80112/LBC.
12. 1969 - Planning permission granted for the erection of a detached garage and car port - Ref. S/69/472/C.
13. 1966 - Planning permission granted for alterations to the dwelling and its access - Ref. S/66/168/C.

NATIONAL GUIDANCE

14. **PPS1** (Delivering Sustainable Development)
15. **PPG15** (Planning and the Historic Environment)

PLANNING POLICIES

16. The Development Plan comprises the East of England Plan, adopted 2008, saved policies in the Suffolk Structure Plan, adopted 2001, and the Babergh Local Plan (Alteration No. 2) adopted 2006. The following policies are relevant to this proposal:

East of England Plan - 2008

- **SS1** (Achieving Sustainable Development)
- **ENV6** (The Historic Environment)
- **ENV7** (Quality in the Built Environment)

Babergh Local Plan (Alteration No. 2) 2006

- **CN01** (Design Standards)
- **CN06** (Development affecting Listed Buildings)
- **CR01** (Character of Countryside)
- **CR04** (Special Landscape Areas)
- **HS33** (Householder Extensions)

The relevant documents can be viewed via the internet. Please see Page 4 for details.

CONSULTATIONS

17. PC - Recommend approval

18. LHA - No objection to the proposal subject to the imposition of conditions to address surfacing of the existing access, and the manoeuvring and parking of vehicles on the site.

REPRESENTATIONS

19. None received.

PLANNING CONSIDERATIONS

20. Key issues in the determination of this application are the impact of the proposal upon the:
- Street scene
 - the host Listed Building, and,
 - the Special Landscape Area.

Street Scene

21. Planning permissions have recently been granted for extensions to the dwelling. In terms of building mass and site area, the property has reached its limits in terms of its operational development capacity. The proposed development would result in the addition of a further residential extension on the site and an unwelcome increase in mass and height of the garage/cartlodge already approved under permission Ref. B/09/00915/FHA. This additional height and massing would result in a building which would unjustifiably impact the character of the existing streetscene and would not be subservient to the host building (the Dandy Cottage), which should remain as the dominant building on the site both visually and operationally.

Impact upon the host Listed Building

22. The host building on the site is the Dandy Cottage, an early 19th Century, one and a half storey cottage, of clay lump and thatched roof construction. The two distinct qualities of the building which form the integrity for its listing are; its construction style and materials, and its "humble", small scale character.
23. PPG 15 (Planning and the Historic Environment, 1994) provides that "modern extensions should not dominate the existing building in either scale, material or situation". Whilst this guidance is provided for extensions, the implication is that the same should be applied to the provision of outbuildings. This provision is strengthened by policy CN06 of the Babergh Local Plan alteration no.2 (2006) which amplifies the point that there is a duty to preserve the setting of a listed building, as much as there is a duty to preserve the building itself.
24. In order to preserve the "humble" character of the building it needs a "humble" outbuilding. The recent planning permissions on the site have already pushed the boundaries of what is acceptable in terms of impacting the character and setting of the listed building. The proposed development, due to its increased height and massing at second-storey level, would cross the line of acceptability and would result in a development which would compete with the height and scale of the listed building, causing unacceptable harm to its character and nature, which cannot be justified as there is no apparent need for further residential floor space on the site, to that already granted under the recent permissions.

Impact upon the Special Landscape Area

25. The development site lies within an area of open countryside designated as a Special Landscape Area (SLA). Policy CR04 of the Babergh Local Plan alteration no.2 (2006) provides that development proposals in SLAs will only be permitted where they maintain or enhance the special landscape qualities of the area, and are designed and sited so as to harmonise with the landscape setting.
26. As previously mentioned, a public footpath runs to the east side and rear of the site, affording public views across the SLA and the rear of the development site at an elevated ground level. The provision of 2 no. rooflights to the south-east roofslope, and the provision of a pair of glazed, folding doors and Juliet balcony at second-storey level in the side elevation of the proposal are unjustified urban intrusions which will do not respect and/or harmonise with the site's special landscape setting.

RECOMMENDATION

That planning permission be **REFUSED** for the following reasons:

The proposed development, namely the erection of a detached garage/cartlodge with first floor guest bedroom, is contrary to the provisions of saved policies CN01, CN06, CR01, CR04 and HS33 of the Babergh Local Plan Alteration No. 2 (2006). These policies state, inter alia, that all new development proposals are required to be of an appropriate scale, form, siting and detailed design for their location; pay particular attention to the scale, form, mass and nature of adjacent development and the environment surrounding the site; retain a setting which is appropriate to listed buildings and the relationship with their surrounds; include fenestration which respects the character of the listed building and the surrounding area; and maintains or enhances the special landscape qualities of the area.

The proposed development by virtue of its height, scale, bulk and massing above ground-floor level, would result in a development that would be detrimental to the existing character of the development site and its surrounds. The proposal would cause material harm to the setting, character and nature of the host listed building and would unjustifiably compete with it in terms of its size and scale. Furthermore the proposal consists of fenestration details at second-storey level which would be detrimental to the setting and visual amenity of the special landscape area, in which it is sited.