

Parish: LINDSEY

Location: Ivydene, The Tye

Proposal: Alterations to existing single storey rear extension including increase in height to provide accommodation at first floor level

Applicant: Mr Terndrup

Case Officer: Elizabeth Truscott

Date for Determination: 02/05/10

---

**A Panel of Members visited the site on 19 May 2010 to assess the impact of the proposals upon the street scene and neighbouring properties.**

### **THE SITE**

1. Ivydene is located within Lindsey Tye, and is part of a group of dwellings within the countryside. Ivydene is a Grade II thatched and rendered cottage with a single storey link extension. Within the site there are a number of outbuildings, located to the South of the cottage, these include a barn and garaging and are generally black boarded with a mixture of pan and plain tiles. To the North of the dwelling is the neighbouring property, The Old Forge, which is situated forward of Ivydene.

### **THE PROPOSAL**

2. The application is for Planning Permission and Listed Building Consent for alterations to an existing single storey rear extension to include an increase in height to provide accommodation at first floor level. The proposal would involve the raising of the height of the existing extension by 1.5 metres to create a further bedroom and ensuite. It is also proposed to replace the existing render and plain tile roof of the extension with horizontal timber boarding to match the existing dwelling and pan tile roof. The link element of the extension would remain as it is, at single storey level.

### **RELEVANT HISTORY**

3. B/91/00186/LBC Erection of single storey extension and internal alterations – Approved 22/03/91.
4. B/91/0187/FHA Erection of single-storey rear extension and erection of granny annexe – Approved 22/03/91.

### **NATIONAL GUIDANCE**

5. **PPS 1** (Delivering Sustainable Development)
6. **PPS5** (Planning and the Historic Environment)

### **PLANNING POLICIES**

7. The Development Plan comprises the East of England Plan, adopted 2008, saved policies in the Suffolk Structure Plan, adopted 2001, and the Babergh Local Plan (Alteration No. 2) adopted 2006. The following policies are relevant to this proposal:

### **East of England Plan - 2008:**

- **ENV7** (Quality in the Built Environment)

### **Babergh Local Plan (Alteration No. 2) 2006**

- **HS33** (Extension to Existing Dwellings)
- **CN06** (Listed Building – Alteration/ Extension/ Change of Use)

**The relevant documents can be viewed via the internet. Please see Page 3 for details.**

### **CONSULTATIONS**

8. Parish Council: Approve - the scale of the proposed extension would not detract from the setting of the listed building, and would compliment, in terms of appearance and proportions the character of Ivydene. Given the layout and positioning of the extension no detrimental effect to the amenities enjoyed by the neighboring properties would be suffered and there would be no negative impact on the street scene.

### **REPRESENTATIONS**

9. Neighbours at the adjacent property The Old Forge have commented that the proposed extension is capable of causing a loss of privacy and have asked for a condition to be placed on any permission to restrict new windows on the first floor or roof facing The Old Forge.

### **PLANNING CONSIDERATIONS**

#### **Principle of development**

10. The proposal is for an extension to an existing residential dwelling. Therefore, in accordance with Policy HS033 and PPS1, the principle of the development is acceptable subject to compliance with other relevant planning policies including CN06.

#### **Impact on the character of the area**

11. Policy CN01 states that all new development proposals must pay particular attention to the scale, form and nature of adjacent development and the environment surrounding the site. The proposed first floor extension would be set back from the road, behind the existing cottage and would only be partially visible from the streetscene. As such it is not considered detrimental to the character of the area and is acceptable in design terms.

#### **Impact on residential amenity**

12. Policy HS33 states that planning permission will be granted to extend a dwelling if the proposal does not reduce the level of amenity enjoyed by occupants of neighbouring property. The proposed extension would be located close to the boundary with the neighbouring property The Old Forge. As proposed the first floor windows would be located on the side elevation away from The Old Forge and therefore no loss of privacy to the occupiers of The Old Forge will occur. It is proposed to include a condition to restrict the introduction of windows and roof openings on the elevation facing The Old Forge in the future.

### **Impact on the listed building**

13. Policy CN06 states that proposals for extensions to listed buildings should be of an appropriate scale, form, siting and detailed design to harmonise with the existing building and its setting.
14. Ivydene is a Grade II Listed Building and is of timber frame construction, with a plastered exterior beneath a thatched roof. It has one storey and attics, with the first floor accommodation located within the roofspace. To the rear of the historic range is a linked single storey extension constructed following an approval in 1991.
15. Under section 16 of the Listed Building Act the primary duty of the Local Planning Authority is to have special regard to the desirability of preserving the character of the Listed Building. It has long been accepted practice that extensions which involve cutting into the thatch are not to be supported. More recently extensions which alter the appreciation of gable ends of listed thatch cottages have been regarded as equally undesirable.
16. Consequently extensions to thatched cottages were generally restricted to single storey additions to the side and rear. The response to this was that the concept of a linked extensions emerged in the 1990s, which consisted of small linking components between the existing historic range and new accommodation wing. The existing single storey extension at Ivydene is an early example of such a development.
17. During the course of the past 10 – 15 years the scale of new accommodation wings have steadily grown to the point where some have had a detrimental impact upon the modest scale of thatched cottages. Consequently officers have advocated that linked accommodation blocks should preferably not provide more than single storey accommodation in order that the normally modest thatched listed building remains dominant within its site. English Heritage guidance supports this view stating that new structures attached to buildings by link additions generally do not compose well with the building to which they are attached and the inappropriate nature of this type of extension is exacerbated by the increased scale. Guidance also states that it is recognised that such linked extension have often been provided in an attempt to avoid obscuring of damaging historic fabric.
18. Policy HE9 of PPS5 (Planning and the Historic Environment) states that there should be a presumption in favour of the conservation of heritage assets (including listed buildings) and that the significance of a heritage asset can be harmed through alteration. In the case of Ivydene the significance of the building is that it is a surviving example of a modest thatched building which in terms of its form is relatively unaltered externally. As such single storey extensions to either the gable ends or to the rear would be detrimental to the character of the building. This limits the opportunity to extend the dwelling. The major disadvantage of the proposed development is that the roof to wall ratio of the proposed block will be disproportionate to the historic range. The result will be a larger expanse of wall compared with the roof than the historic range, which is not the case of the existing single storey extension. However, the proposed development would involve a very modest increase in height by 1.5 metres and is accompanied by more sympathetic facing and roofing materials. On balance it is considered that Ivydene is such a case where the proposed extension would be more sympathetic to the character of the Listed Building than the provision of single storey extensions.

## **REASON FOR DECISION**

19. The proposed development is considered to be in accordance with Adopted Development Plan Policy of ENV7 of the East of England Plan 2008, in addition to Policies CN01, HS33 and CN06 of the Babergh Local Plan Alteration No.2, by reason of this scheme constituting a development that is acceptable in terms of layout, design, scale and relationship to adjoining development. The proposal would not have an adverse impact upon residential amenity or the character and appearance of the area. Furthermore the proposal is in accordance with PPS5: Planning for the Historic Environment (2010), and saved policy CN06 of the Babergh Local Plan Alteration No. 2 (2006).

## **RECOMMENDATION**

That planning permission and listed building consent be granted, subject to the following conditions:

- Standard Time limit
- Submission of material samples
- Details of colour to joinery
- Fenestration Details
- Removal of Permitted Development Rights for windows within the North elevation (planning permission application only)